Social Networking Usage and Trends Among Voters of Sindh, Pakistan

Abdul Razaque Chhachhar [a], [*], Rubab Rafique Malik [a]

[a] Department of Media and Communication Studies, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan

Abstract

Unlike the preceding campaigns, developments in media technology come up with efficient and effective media campaigns, providing candidates more possibilities to attain even larger groups of constituents with very little effort. However, with the advent of new media traditional media sustain its place in politics. Politicians still utilize traditional media to provide political information but still, the growth of the Internet and its associated technologies has made a profound impact on contemporary political campaigns. Internet-based activism for a wide variety of political causes has also increased due to the growth of social media technologies, such as Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube. Through this study, the researcher tries to investigate which medium has greater exposure to political content. For this purpose, researchers select three main Political Parties of Pakistan, having most of the public affiliation. These political parties are "Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PML N), Pakistan People's Party (PPP), and Pakistan Tehreek e Insaaf (PTI) the data was collected by applying a purposive nonprobability sampling technique. Whereas, the finding is presented in tabular form and then the data findings in the table have been described. The key finding showed those respondents were frequent users of social media specifically Facebook and Twitter. They have enough exposure to political content through social media. The finding shows that users consume knowledge regarding party manifestos and have much knowledge of political content through social media political campaigns. Despite social media, traditional media also has a profound reach to the audience with political content.

Keywords: social media, traditional media, political campaign, political content.

1. Introduction

The mass media is usually supposed to play an influential role in foster national politics. Media exposure strongly affects people's and their opinion about politics, society, and culture. The internet is currently a fundamental aspect of modern political campaigns by offering more political content about their respective parties. The development of the Internet and its related technologies has had a great impact on contemporary political campaigns. Now new media has been amazingly popular at getting the attention of the younger population while helping all populations organize and promote action (Jensen, Wenzelburger, 2021).

We use the term "New Media" to narrate media ecologies, such as publications, Television, and Radio. These types of media are "converging" into "Digital Media" with time, especially interactive media and media for Social connection and interactions like Social media. Sites of Social networking are becoming much more popular, widespread, and better-liked and have become part of everyday life (Bargh, McKenna, 2004). Nowadays consumption of news is not as

---

[*] Corresponding author
E-mail addresses: abdul.razaque@usindh.edu.pk (A.R. Chhachhar)

alike as pre-satellite news when readers waited for their morning newspapers or are seated at a specific moment in time for the evening news bulletin on television.

News consumption today is also not as similar as pre-internet news broadcasts when viewers set into events all over the globe via 24/7 TV news channels. More recently, an increasing quantity of newspaper readers, TV audiences, and radio listeners are being connected to the internet for their news updates. Tv sets, dailies, and radio sets are still at the point however there is an increasing race from collaborative online media. It can be used to advance the psycho-educational model for creating involvement for the management of social media use (Baglari, et al., 2020).

The BBC reported in its yearly report (2008-2009), TV is largely reaching amongst 16-34 age group, the general audience has dropped by more than 7 % during the year 2003 to 2008, from 82.6-75.4 %. BBC report also exposed the quantity of BBC tv channel watching by youngsters in 2003 have decreased from thirty-nine minutes per day to twenty-four minutes a day in 2008, approximately 40 % decline in a duration of 5-year. Similarly in the US, a study of 2008 exposed that 40 percent of those studied gained mostly their national and international news bulletin from the net, upward from 24 percent in 2007. The reporting of United States political campaign on the internet (boosted by SNS) remained the leading root for that recent increase. According to 'The Nielsen Company', in December 2009 users around the globe consumed over 5 and half hours on SNS like Facebook and Twitter, a rise of 82 percent as compared to the similar time the last year when consumers have been using SNS sites only above 3 hours. Moreover, the general stream to SNS sites has full-fledged throughout the past 3 years (Nielson, 2010).

Agenda-Setting theory explains the power of the media to affect the importance of a matter or a concerning issue on the public agenda. If a bulletin of news is covered regularly either on traditional media or on new media the public will value, the subject as largely important as others. One more primary belief is that mass media don't express realism, they strain the real one and then form it and due to that diverse media journals have diverse agendas (McCombs, Shaw, 1972).

Traditionally, the most prevalent means to carry out campaign strategies and policies is the mass media. Whether it is newspaper, radio, or television, mass media have been subjected to election campaigns for over a hundred years. However, the performance of the mass media, which are driven by power and money to select and form information, fosters Work in media effects has measured for years the extent to which the media information and update and also notify the public what to think about and how to think about it (Cohen, 1963).

However, we know surprisingly little about the role of political leaders in advising the public about political choices throughout the electoral cycle (Huber et al., 2020). So, this research tries to investigate this tendency in political communication especially in the context of the Pakistan general election 2018. Moreover, it also tries to comprehend how social media sets the agenda for election campaigns amongst people (Karamat, 2016).

The main aim of this study to find the comparison between social media and print media to disseminate political information during the general election 2018 and to analyze how people utilize both traditional and new media to gratified their respective needs specifically political content.

2. Materials and methods

To collect data from the target population survey method has been designed for this research. The data was collected by using a well-designed questionnaire. The researcher simply used Krejcie and Morgan (Krejcie, Morgan, 1997) to determining reliable sample sizes to conduct a survey. For this purpose, a sample of 384 out of 1049586 respondents from district Hyderabad has drawn from the four main taluka of Hyderabad (Latifabad, Qasimabad, Hyderabad city, and Rural Hyderabad). Where 96 respondents had selected purposefully on pre-determined characteristics from each Taluka for the data collection. The data was collected from the age group of 18 to 35, years old respondents because the voter of this age group usually uses social media frequently. This questionnaire comprised of close-ended questions according to the needs and desires of the researcher. Finally, the data were analyzed using data analysis software SPSS version 20.

3. Discussion

Political advertising is a form of campaigning used by political candidates to attain and manipulate voters. It can consist of numerous distinct mediums and extend over several months for a political campaign (Williams et al., 2021). Digital media have become an integral part of individual citizens' political lives as a growing number of people around the world use digital media

technologies for information and communication. Over the last decades, social media has gained the status of being a popular choice of communication amongst people. Not only in developed countries like the US and UK but developing countries like India have become one of the prime users of social media. Now, India has surpassed the US (which ranks 2nd to India) in terms of Facebook users in the world followed by Brazil and Indonesia. These debates sometimes take the face of social protest, sometimes of activism, have even led to the convincing of the ruling administration and in some cases, change in-laws of the nation (Kenski, Conway, 2016).

If we examine the effect social media had on the political decision-making of a country, we will find that everywhere in the world every major country to some level or the other has been realized by it. For example, the 2008 US Presidential Election, when Barack Obama became the President for the first time, had been called by various critics as a win by social media. It is now an acknowledged fact that Barack Obama cast off social media to its full potential (Moldovan, 2013).

Moreover, the 2008 US Presidential Election was the primary example of in what manner social media can use to gather popular votes and prompt popular feelings and sentiments. Later the massively effective social media campaigns of the 2008 Election, came Arab Spring 2011. Social Media networking sites played a fundamental part in determining political debates in the Arab Spring.

There are various debates and arguments about the origins of the utilization of social media for political interaction with communication channels (Morris, 2018). One cannot pinpoint the time or the place to begin political campaigns in social media but few examples are dating back to 1996 when political parties had started using online campaigning. Within the use of America, there were political parties that launched their official campaign websites in 1996 and which remained dominant till 2000. In the year 2004, political blogs remained the main core of the recent media environment in United State Presidential campaigns and observed as the shift to greater use of communicating form of online political engagement. At the United States of America Congressional elections 2006, social media through SNS were employed differently to focus on voters, emerging as the important applicable tool for voters (Kenski, Conway, 2016).

In the 2013 election, almost all major political parties of Pakistan have also cast off Social media for this purpose. All political parties are utilizing Social media sites like Myspace, Orkut, Twitter, and Facebook on regular basis (Moldovan, 2013). These Political parties are trying to establish political communication between voters and political parties to develop their party ideology as well as providing day-to-day report revisions about their authority and party efforts (Carty, 2010). On Social media, active and regular participation in Pakistan has become a political norm and attitude for the leading political parties.

According to the Journal of Politics and Law (2018), within the previous US presidential election of 2016, the interaction between the American media and then Donald Trump was notable and exceptional from both political perspectives and communication viewpoints. As there had remained mostly verbal clashes between Donald Trump, and some media, particularly CNN, that expelled them to be one amongst his biggest opponents. The 2016 US presidential election coverage by CNN news made Cable Network News channel the foremost seen in its record history (Katz, 2016) and therefore the third in entire audiences with 788 thousand for a rise of twenty-five percent in the year 2016 (Otterson, 2017). The reporting on the presidential election 2016 by CNN increased critiques from Trump likewise as his opponents. In the 2016 U.S. presidential campaign, both the traditional media and social media platforms, like Twitter, were critical in attempts to influence voters. Before the 2016 presidential election, the assumption was that campaign messages sent through the traditional media are perceived as more effectual by the public than those sent via Twitter (Morris, 2017)?

4. Results
The objective of this study is to assess respondents' level of utilization of social media (Facebook and Twitter) vs traditional media, to what extent exposure to various content and political parties' manifestos of both media and assess political information by social media and traditional media.

Table 1 the respondents were asked about their gender where result shows that more than half 58.3 % of the respondents were male while 41.7 % of the respondents were female. Moreover, the result regarding age indicated in table 1that 45.1 % of the respondents' age was 18 to 22 years, 23.7 % of the respondents' age was 23 to 26 years, 16.1% of the respondents' age was 27 to 30 years and 15.1 % of the respondents' age were 31 to 25 years old. However, the respondents were inquired about their education level where result revealed that 1.8 %of the respondents were illiterate, 3.1 %

respondent's education level was primary, 11.2 % of the respondents' education were Matriculation while 26.3 % of the respondents were intermediate, 47.1 % of the respondents' education level were graduation and rest 10.4 % of the respondents' education level was Masters. The respondents were also asked about their marital status most of the respondents 65.9 % was Single while the rest of the 34.1 % were married. The result regarding profession indicated that the majority 39.6 % were students, 15.6 % were government employed, 19.5 % were privately employed, 14.6 % have their own business, while the rest of the 10.7 % were unemployed. Overall 55 % earn approx. 10,000 to 20,00/ month while 45 % earn above 20,000 approximately.

Table 1. Demographic Profile

Variables	Frequency	Percentage
Gender		
Male	224	58.3
Female	160	41.7
Age		
18-22	173	45.1
23-26	91	23.7
27-30	62	16.1
31-35	58	15.1
Education		
Illiterate	7	1.8
Primary	12	3.1
Matric	43	11.2
Intermediate	101	26.3
Graduation	181	47.1
Masters	41	10.4
Other	0	0
Marital status		
Single	253	65.9
Married	131	34.1
Occupation		
Govt. employed	60	15.6
Private employed	75	19.5
Unemployed	41	10.7
Own Business	56	14.6
Student	152	39.6
Monthly Income		
10000-20000	211	55.0
21000-above	173	45.0
Resident		
Hyderabad city	96	25.0
Latifabad	96	25.0
Qasimabad	96	25.0
Hyderabad	96	25.0

n = 384

Table 2 respondents inquiring about the frequencies of social media utilizing where result indicated that (27.6 %) Are those respondents who answered as very much in use of Face book (33.3 %) are those who responded as much. In the somewhat category of Facebook (19.3 %) respondents provided their response. In the rare category, a total (19.5 %) respondents gave answers, while (3.0 %) responded as they didn't use Facebook at all. Twitter was the second popular location for respondents who are utilizing and visiting this site. (20.3 %) of respondents responded as they are using Twitter very much. Furthermore, (19.5 %) are following that they are utilizing Twitter in many categories. (19.8 %) respond as somewhat. (14.3 %) as rarely and (26.0 %) answered as not at all. The mean and standard deviation of Facebook is 2.3 and 1.0 respectively. Meanwhile, Twitter's mean is 3.0 and the standard deviation is 1.4.

Table 2. How frequently do you use the following social media?

Variables	Very Much	Much	Somewhat	Rarely	Not at all	Mean	St. Deviation
Face book	106 (27.6 %)	128 (33.3 %)	74 (19.3 %)	75 (19.5 %)	1 (3 %)	2.3	1.0
Twitter	78 (20.3 %)	75 (19.5 %)	76 (19.8 %)	55 (14.3 %)	100 (26.0 %)	3.0	1.4

n = 384

Table 3 displays the outcomes of a question regarding the evaluation of time spending of respondents on Social media and traditional media. (10.9 %) and (11.5 %) responded rarely and not at all respectively. (23.4 %) of a respondent responded that they were spending more time on social media while (25.8 %) of a respondent responded that they strongly agreeing (very much) that they are spending more time on Social media as compared to traditional Media. The mean of this inquiry is 2.58 and the standard deviation is 1.29. If we evaluate the statistical result and the outcomes of this inquiry, we investigate that a huge (28.4 %) of respondents are somewhat agreeing with this inquiry. That shows that sample dimensions of this study were somewhat time spending on Social media than traditional media.

Table 4 displays the exposure of Social media contents on the respondents. The analytical outlook shows that a total of (27.6 %) are revealing from informative education contents very much. (26.5 %) answered as Much exposing to this category (18.8 %) answered as somewhat (9.4 %) are rarely and (17.7 %) of respondents are granted response as not at all. The mean of the education category is 2.6 and the standard deviation is 1.4. In answer to exposure from Social media entertainment contents, most of the respondents responded as very much and much. (37.8 %) responded as very much and (28.9 %) granted answers as much. (14.1 %) Responded as Somewhat, (10.1 %) as rarely and (9.1 %) of overall feedback as not at all. If we look at the political content's category, we preview that a very large no of respondents is utilizing Social media to gratify their desires. The mean and standard deviation of the entertainment category is 2.2 and 1.3.

Table 3. To what extent you spend more time on Social media than traditional media?

Variable	Frequency	Percent	Mean	Std. deviation
Very much	99	25.8	2.58	1.29
Much	90	23.4		
Somewhat	109	28.4		
Rarely	42	10.9		
Not at all	44	11.5		

** Values show in percentage (%), n = 384

A total figure of (25.3 %) is revealing to political contents of Social media very much. (20.8 %) of respondents are revealing to political contents, and they responded as much. (20.5 %) responded as somewhat and (14.6 %) conveyed their eagerness as rarely, and Figure of (18.8 %) responded as not at all. If we investigate much and somewhat category on the respondents, then we can observe that it is a little different on both categories with a difference of 0.3 percent. This appears that

respondents are approximately identically revealing from the political contents of Social media. However, the overall view shows that respondents are very strongly revealing from political contents of Social media but not in the comparisons to entertainment and education category as the frequency of both categories as much higher than political category. The results also reveal that the political category's mean is 2.8 and the standard deviation is 1.4.

In the religious contents, (21.4 %) of respondents answered that they are exposed to devout contents very much and a total of (22.4 %) responded as much. (25.5 %) answered that they are revealed as somewhat and (14.6 %) are revealing rarely in religious contents of Social media. (16.1 %) of respondents responded there will as not at all. The mean and standard deviation of this category is 2.8 and 1.35 respectively. The sports content category shows that a total of (24.5 %) respondents responded very much to the exposure of sports contents, while (18.5 %) of respondents are granted their answer as much exposure from sports contents of Social media. (19.3 %) of respondents responded that they are revealing from sports contents as somewhat. (9.4 %) responded that they are revealing rarely and (28.3 %) responded as not at all. The mean of the sports category is 2.9 and the standard deviation is 1.5.

Table 4. To what extent do you expose to the following contents of Social media

Variable	Very much	Much	Somewhat	Rarely	Not at all	Mean	Std
Education	106 (27.6 %)	102 (26.5 %)	72 (18.8 %)	36 (9.4 %)	68 (17.7 %)	2.6	1.4
Entertainment	145 (37.8 %)	111 (28.9 %)	54 (14.1 %)	39 (10.1 %)	35 (9.1 %)	2.2	1.3
Politics	97 (25.3 %)	80 (20.8 %)	79 (20.5 %)	56 (14.6 %)	72 (18.8 %)	2.8	1.4
Religious	82 (21.4 %)	86 (22.4 %)	98 (25.5 %)	56 (14.6 %)	62 (16.1 %)	2.8	1.35
Sports	94 (24.5 %)	71 (18.5 %)	74 (19.3 %)	36 (9.4 %)	109 (28.3 %)	2.9	1.5

n = 384

Table 5 displays the overall exposure to traditional media contents. If we take only the higher frequency of each category, we get the outcome as (24.0 %) respondents are more likely to (much) expose by education to traditional media with the mean and standard deviation of 2.88 and 1.4, respectively.

The highest frequency of entertainment is related to much or more likely to expose with the figure of (29.2 %). The mean of this category is 2.7 and Std is1.3. While overall (27.3 %) of the respondents' responses that they get political content very much from traditional media with its mean of 2.8 and a standard deviation of 1.5. The highest frequency in the category of religious content is not at all exposure (23.2 %), its mean is 3.0 and the standard deviation is 1.4. while sport's content is very much as (26.3 %). The mean of this category is 2.9 and the standard deviation is 1.5.

Table 6 also indicates the frequency of political knowledge from two different mediums, which are Social media and traditional media, in these inquiry respondents, responded to the comparison of gaining political knowledge between Social media and other Media. Several (16.4 %) responded that they have strongly agreed that they are gaining much political knowledge from Social media as compared to electronic/print media. Likewise (33.1%) responded as agreeing to this response. (20.1 %) of respondents that do not agree to this inquiry. (14.0%) of respondents are strongly disagreeing with this question; only (16.4 %) responded to this question as not at all. The mean and standard deviation of this inquiry is 2.8 and 1.3 respectively.

Table 5. What extent does you like to expose with traditional media?

Variable	Very much	Much	Somewhat	Rarely	Not at all	Mean	Std
Education	81 (21.1%)	92 (24.0%)	84 (21.9%)	46 (12.0%)	81 (21.1%)	2.88	1.4
Entertainment	86 (22.4%)	112 (29.2%)	75 (19.5%)	41 (10.7%)	70 (18.2%)	2.7	1.3
Politics	105 (27.3%)	81 (21.1%)	58 (15.1%)	47 (12.2%)	93 (24.2%)	2.8	1.5
Religious	78 (20.3%)	72 (18.8%)	81 (21.1%)	64 (16.7%)	89 (23.2%)	3.0	1.4
Sports	101 (26.3%)	65 (16.9%)	75 (19.5%)	55 (14.3%)	88 (22.9%)	2.9	1.5

** Values show in percentage (%), n = 384

Table 6. Do you understand that you gain more political knowledge on Social media as compare to traditional media?

Variable	Frequency	Percent	Mean	Std. deviation
Very much	63	16.4	2.8	1.3
Much	127	33.1		
Somewhat	77	20.1		
Rarely	54	14.0		
Not at all	63	16.4		

** values show in percentage (%), n=384

Table 7. The next question, which is inquired by the researcher, is about the satisfaction from Social media than electronic and print media of respondents considering government. We can glimpse the table (7) and investigate that (12.2 %) of respondents responded very much to this question, and they are democratically persuaded from Social media as a contrast to traditional Media. (34.6 %) of respondents are responded as much from this inquiry. A Figure of (18.4 %) respondents as somewhat from this inquiry. In this question (12.0 %) of respondents are rarely and (22.7 %) are granted their answer as not at all. The mean of this inquiry is 2.98 and the standard deviation is 1.36.

Table 7. Politically influenced from Social media Political Party official pages than Electronic Media and Print Media

How much you politically influenced by Social media Political Party official pages than Electronic Media and Print Media?	Frequency	Percent	Mean	Std. deviation
Very much	47	12.2		
Much	133	34.6		
Somewhat	71	18.4	2.98	1.36
Rarely	46	12.0		
Not at all	87	22.7		

n = 384

5. Conclusion

The researcher realized that assessing political information in the form of television, radio, and newspaper, as well as from rallies and town hall meetings were no longer enough to elect a better candidate. To elect better political candidates and to understand the nation's democracy and politics, voters consume both new and traditional media. So politicians will now require combining new media as well as some of the traditional campaign tactics to win elections (Sebastian et al., 2018). This General Election has seen a major change concerning the marketing actions done by significant national as well as local/regional parties. The existence of social media has significantly impacted the democratic scenario of the country.

Globally, Social media becomes a new paradigm of the 21st century. In the present political situation of Social media political communication, there is a need for concern between political parties and political experts. Through Social media sites, almost all political parties are swapping their ideology and party viewpoint with the respondents. The political parties can fascinate youth's vision and control matters panels through Social media sites (Ahmed, Motin, 2020). In this research study, we can find out that there are many fundamental Relationships, which are to be uncovered between a politician, political parties, and registered voters. With the help and assistance of special use of Social media sites, we can do examine the political approach and the public's exposure towards political content.

This research study supports the concepts of Uses and Gratification theory. According to theory, the audience is perceived as active. All the respondents of this study responded to their reaction as active members. Social media sites, mainly Facebook and Twitter are generally granted the public to get access to political parties and politicians' official pages. Over these undertakings, social media users can know about the party ideology and philosophy. Some respondent supports other media to attain political information. However, social media networking sites are in very large transitional currently for the mainstream political parties of Pakistan. These general parties are still trying to boost their goodwill ahead of social media users, particularly youth.

The purpose of Social media from a political perspective is to inform and update people about political parties and political leader's ideology, and it arises exactly under the Media surveillance function. Social media is also activating youth through its hardworking participation in political communication at an accurate time. In this research study, the experimental result on Social media political parties' pages suggests that there are additional research efforts are required in the area of political connection to check the users' perception, behavior, demeanor, and mindset. If we compare Social media with traditional media, then we indicate a very huge difference between the users of both intermediate. The youth and students, and all other segments of society utilize global Social media.

References

Auwal, Ersoy, 2020 – Auwal, A.M., Ersoy, M. (2020). Peace journalism strategy for covering online political discourses in a multipolar society and the new public sphere. *Information Development*. XX(X): 1-17.

Baglari et al., 2020 – Baglari, H., Sharma, M.K., Marimuthu, P.N.S. (2020). Pattern of social media use among youth: Implication for social media literacy. *Mental Health and Addiction Research*. 5(1): 1-5.

Bargh, McKenna, 2004 – Bargh, J.A., McKenna, K.Y. (2004). The Internet and social life. *Annu. Rev. Psychol.* 55: 573-590.

Carty, 2010 – Carty, V. (2010). Wired and mobilizing: Social movements, new technology, and electoral politics. Vol. 13. New York: Routledge.

Clarke, 2019 – Clarke, K. (2019). The role of social media in political campaigns. [Electronic resource]. URL: https://strategicsocialmedialab.com/the-role-of-social-media-in-political-campaigns/

Cohen, 1963 – Cohen, B.C. (1963). The press and foreign policy. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Huber, et al., 2020 – Huber, L.M., Bodlos, A., Graf, E., Meyer, T.M. (2020). Disseminating legislative debates: How legislators communicate the parliamentary agenda. *Party Politics*. XX(X): 1-12.

Jensen, Wenzelburger, 2021 – Jensen, C., Wenzelburger, G. (2021). Welfare state reforms and mass media attention: Evidence from three European democracies. *European Journal of Political Research*. Preprint. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-6765.12435

Karamat, Farooq, 2020 – Karamat, A., Farooq, D.A. (2020). Emerging role of social media in political activism: Perceptions and practices. *South Asian Studies*. 31(1): 381-396.

Katz, Lazarsfeld, 1996 – Katz, E., Lazarsfeld, P. F. (1966). Personal Influence: The part played by people in the flow of mass communications. New York: Free Press.

Kenski, Conway, 2016 – Kenski, K., Conway, B.A. (2016). Social Media and Elections. In Benoit, W.L. (ed.). Praeger Handbook of Political Campaigning in the United States California: ABC-CLIO, LIC.

Krejcie, Morgan, 1970 – Krejcie, R.V., Morgan, D.W. (1970). Determining sample size for research activities. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*. 30(3): 607-610.

McCombs, Shaw, 1972 – *McCombs, M.E., Shaw, D.L.* (1972). The agenda-setting function of mass media. *Public Opinion Quarterly*. 36(2): 176-187.

Morris, 2018 – *Morris, D.S.* (2018). Twitter versus the traditional media: A survey experiment comparing public perceptions of campaign messages in the 2016 US presidential election. *Social Science Computer Review*. 36(4): 456-468.

Stier et al., 2018 – *Stier, S., Bleier, A., Lietz, H., Strohmaier, M.* (2018). Election campaigning on social media: Politicians, audiences, and the mediation of political communication on Facebook and Twitter. *Political communication*. 35(1): 50-74.

Tari, Emamzadeh, 2018 – *Tari, Z.G., Emamzadeh, Z.* (2018). An analysis of the media messages during the 2016 US Presidential Election: A thematic comparison between CNN news and Donald Trump's tweets. *Journal of Politics and Law*. 11(2): 78-87.

Williams, Tkach, 2021 – *Williams, A., Tkach, B.K.* (2021). Access and dissemination of information and emerging media convergence in the Democratic Republic of Congo. *Information, Communication Society:* 1-17.